

## A Portrait of Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt by Lucas Cranach the Elder

by Alejandro Zorzin  
*Karlstadt-Edition (2014)*

**Summary:** The 1522 painting by Cranach the Elder is with high probability an accurate portrayal of Andreas Bodenstein of Karlstadt. This painting, along with a re-evaluation of the history of research on Karlstadt images, unmask the widespread image of the "sinister iconoclast" as a mere historical construct. If this unidentified portrait indeed depicts Karlstadt, it contains multiple significances for the history of Reformation: It would be the first painting of a Reformer with a certain dating, the first painting of a married reformed cleric and an indication that Karlstadt's critique of religious images in January 1522 was not an attack against the secular painting outside of the church. This presumed double portrait of Karlstadt and his wife may have survived the centuries because, it was a work of extraordinary quality by Cranach the Elder and since it lacked any indication of the identification of the sitters, it was saved from any positional motivated destruction.

In books and contributions about Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt, depictions can be found which have influenced his reception in significant ways until the present day. Born in the Franconian city of Karlstadt in 1486, he was a preacher and university professor in Basel from 1534 until his death in 1541.<sup>1</sup> The only two pictures of him known to date originate from this time in Basel. The following essay will trace the question of whether the possibly first and most significant portrait of Karlstadt has remained unattended for the last 500 years. After a (I) survey of the known images of Karlstadt and their use and influence, (II) the 1522 portrait of Lucas Cranach the Elder (1472-1553) will be introduced with the attempt to identify the sitters. The last part of this approximation will deal with (III) the relationship between Cranach the Elder and Karlstadt.

### I. Karlstadt images

In a report to Julius Pflug concerning the Leipzig Disputation of summer 1519, the humanist Petrus Mosellanus<sup>2</sup>, at that time a Leipzig resident, described the contestants who occupied center stage: Luther, Karlstadt, and Eck<sup>3</sup>. Mosellan wrote that Luther's sophistication and erudition were mirrored in Karlstadt in a somewhat attenuated way, although Karlstadt was of smaller stature, had tanned skin and an unclear and less attractive voice.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Ulrich Bubenheimer, Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt, in: Hans Hillerbrand (ed.), *Encyclopedia of the Reformation*, (Oxford 1996), vol.1, pp. 178 - 180; Alejandro Zorzin, Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt, in: Carter Lindbergh (ed.), *The Reformation Theologians*, Oxford 2002, pp. 327-337(<http://karlstadt-edition.org/library/biography/>).

<sup>2</sup> On Mosellanus and Pflug cf. Peter Bietenholz (ed.), *Contemporaries of Erasmus* (Toronto 1987), vol. 2 (p. 466f.) and vol. 3 (p. 77f.).

<sup>3</sup> On Eck see Bietenholz (as in note 3) vol. 1 (p. 416 -419), and Ingo Trütter, Johannes Eck (1486-1543): Academic Career and Self-Fashioning around 1500, in: Richard Kirwan (ed.), *Scholarly Self-Fashioning and Community in the Early Modern University* (Farnham 2013) pp. 59-77.

<sup>4</sup> "Haec pleraque omnia in Carolostadio paulo minora deprehendas. Nisi quod huic statura est breviar, facies autem nigricans et adusta. Vox obscura et inamoena, memoria infirmior et ad iracundiam promptior." (Mosellan to Pflug, 6 December 1519; e.g. in Valentin Ernst Löscher, *Vollständige Reformatationsakta und Dokumente*, vol.3, 1729, p. 248); quoted in Hermann Barge, *Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt*, vol.1, Leipzig 1905, p. 153, note 66.

Hermann Barge, in his epoch-making biography of Karlstadt (1905), rendered Mosellan's description accurately.<sup>5</sup> On the cover page of his biography, Barge published a copperplate print portrait which was preserved in Basel and is said to portray Karlstadt in a three-quarter profile (Fig. 1).<sup>6</sup> This image of Karlstadt was further disseminated by Otto Alfred Schwede's Karlstadt novel (1975), which is actually the widest circulated publication about Karlstadt. Readers would surely have looked to the face portrayed on the cover page when reading Schwede's description (based mainly on Barge) as he attempted to unveil Karlstadt's psychological traits: "Didn't he look like a clever little mouse, the learned Doctor Karlstadt? His long, slender nose stretched far along his face and gave him a sly expression. Beside it lay dark brown eyes in narrow slits. The whites of his eyes were spotted brown here and there, and in a rage, his eyes could flash like those of Doctor Martin Luther. And like Luther, his cheekbones protruded from his face. Karlstadt's mouth was small and it looked like he constantly bit his lower lip. [...] The Franconian from the Main was small and skinny. Those who did not know him would judge him as a foreign academic, of which there were not few in Wittenberg - perhaps a man from Illyria. This impression was conveyed especially due to his brownish skin complexion with numerous dark brown spots."<sup>7</sup>

Erich Hertzsch overstated Mosellan's description of Karlstadt's appearance when he translated Mosellan's "*faciens nigricans et adusta*" with "negrolike face" [1952/53]<sup>8</sup> and typified it as "a face, reminiscent of a negro" in the introduction to his widely distributed edition of Karlstadt's publications of 1523 to 1525 (1956).<sup>9</sup> Gordon Rupp adopted these phrases from Hertzsch and introduced Karlstadt into the English-speaking academic community as having "a swarthy, (almost) negroid, ... appearance" (1959 and 1969).<sup>10</sup> Ernst Kähler added a copperplate print from about 1700 to his contribution on Karlstadt (1952)<sup>11</sup>, which on the right side displays a portrayal of him that could

<sup>5</sup> "Luther's intellectual merits are also present in Karlstadt in somewhat diminished measure...Karlstadt is smaller in stature. There is a brownish tinge to his face. His voice is inarticulate and not very congenial, ... he flies into a rage easily and explodes in sudden anger." (Barge, see note 4; my translation).

<sup>6</sup> "The illustration inserted in the book is in the possession of the Basel University Library [= Falk. 176]; a contemporary handwritten legend under the original designates the portrayed person as Karlstadt." Barge (as in note 4), S. VIII (my translation). Requoted entirely in: Wolfgang Merklein (ed.) Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt 1480-1541. Festschrift der Stadt Karlstadt zum Jubiläumsjahr 1980, Karlstadt 1980, ill. 12, p. 51.; Werner Hoffmann (ed.), Köpfe der Lutherzeit, München 1983, Cat. No. 119, p. 265.

<sup>7</sup> Otto A. Schwede, *Der Widersacher. Ein Karlstadt-Roman*, Berlin 1975 (picture by Hans Stark based on the Basel copperplate-print in the Basel University Library). On this Karlstadt novel see Martin Keßler, *Das Karlstadt-Bild in der Forschung*, Tübingen 2014, pp. 430-446.

<sup>8</sup> Erich Hertzsch, *Luther und Karlstadt*, in: Reinhold Jauering (ed.), *Luther in Thüringen. Gabe der Thüringer Kirche an das Thüringer Volk*, Berlin [1953], pp. 87 - 107.

<sup>9</sup> Erich Hertzsch (ed.), *Karlstadts Schriften aus den Jahren 1523-25*, part I and II (Halle 1956 and 1957), p. XII.

<sup>10</sup> Gordon Rupp, *Andrew Karlstadt and Reformation Puritanism*, *Journal of Theological Studies* NS 10 (1959) p. 308, and idem, *Patterns of Reformation. Part II Andrew Karlstadt. The Reformer as Puritan*, London 1969, p.71 ("Mosellanus has left an unflattering thumbnail sketch of Karlstadt, the little tubby man, with his dark, almost negroid appearance, his harsh, unmelodious voice, his bad temper."); Kessler (as in note 7) notes Rupp's dependence on Hertzsch.

<sup>11</sup> Ernst Kähler, *Karlstadts Protest gegen die theologische Wissenschaft*, in: *450 Jahre Martin Luther Universität Halle-Wittenberg*. [Halle-Wittenberg 1952] vol.1, p. 301. The engraving is also reproduced in Werner Hofmann (ed.), *Luther und die Folgen für die Kunst*, Hamburg 1983, p. 128, fig. 2b; *Katalog der Ausstellung Martin Luther 1483 bis 1546 in der Staatlichen Lutherhalle Wittenberg* [1984], fig. 67 (17,7 x 15,0 cm, Inv. No. 4° XXII 2177); Martin Brecht, *Martin Luther*, vol. 2, Stuttgart 1986, p. 43; "Aller Knecht und Christi Untertan" - *Der Mensch Luther und sein Umfeld*. *Katalog der Ausstellung zum 450. Todesjahr 1996 – Wartburg und Eisenach*, Gotha 1996, p. 334; Volkmar Joestel, *Andreas Bodenstein genannt Karlstadt. Schwärmer und Aufrührer?*, Wittenberg 2000, p. 35. Taking all reprints into consideration one observes that

be interpreted as having a "negroid appearance", while a group smashes images in the background on the left side. Thus, the image of Karlstadt as the "negroid-looking" dissident was firmly established by the beginning of the second half of the last century.<sup>12</sup>

In his 1988 article about Karlstadt in the *Theologische Realenzyklopädie*, Bubenheimer mentioned a printed memorial leaflet with a woodcut portrait [1541/42], published in Basel on the occasion of Karlstadt's death.<sup>13</sup> A reproduction of this three-quarter profile was included in the catalogue of the Berlin exhibition "Bürger und Bauern um 1500".<sup>14</sup> In a poem on this memorial print, Karlstadt's son, Adam<sup>15</sup>, wrote: "Hanc quoties chartam video, laetor simul atque moereo, defunctus namque beatus adest."<sup>16</sup> Even though he attended to the Humanist *topos* of rendering praise to the artist, he emphasized the true-to-life reproduction of his father on the memorial leaflet. On this 15 x 14.5 cm woodcut (figs. 2 and 3), Karlstadt is displayed in a three-quarter, half-length profile facing right. In his right hand he holds a book in front of the folds of his impressive scholarly coat. His face is framed by hair falling just over the ears and a broad, well-groomed, horizontally-cut beard. A thick moustache, hanging wide over the corners of his mouth just allows a slightly opened mouth and a thin lower lip to appear. Beneath the high forehead wrinkled by age, a long nose protrudes from a broad base between the eyebrows. The ridge, tip and nostrils of his nose together with clear, prominent

---

this constitutes a particularly prevalent image of Karlstadt, that reduces him to the role of the "sinister iconoclast" entirely aligned with Luther's "Against the heavenly prophets" (1524/25). See also the painting created by the Antwerp artist Willem Linnig the younger (ca. 1880) for the Reformation room of the Wartburg castle, entitled "Karlstadt und die Bilderstürmer" and portraying a dark Karlstadt dressed in black leading the iconoclasts (in: "Aller Knecht und Christi Untertan" – Der Mensch Luther und sein Umfeld. Katalog der Ausstellung zum 450. Todesjahr 1996 – Wartburg und Eisenach, Gotha 1996, Cat. No. 150, pp. 217-18; also in: <http://karlstadt-edition.org/whats-in-a-face/>).

- <sup>12</sup> There have been various conjectures concerning the possibility of further portraits of Karlstadt. As Gordon Rupp initially pondered (1959/69): "I have sometimes wondered whether Lukas Cranach does not depict K. as Judas in the Wittenberg altar-piece of the Eucharist, in which a bearded Luther appears among the disciples" (Rupp 1959, as note. 7, p. 308-9. note 3); "In the painting in the Wittenberg parish church (1547), in which Our Lord is shown giving communion to his disciples among which is Luther, Judas is shown as a small, negroid figure much as Karlstadt is said to have been." (Rupp 1969, as in note 10, p. 141). Joestel (as in note 11, p. 33) also calls attention to a Eucharist altar-piece in the Parrish church of Bockau (Erzgebirge), attributed to the Cranach school of the sixteenth century, where the (swarthy) Judas supposedly shows the facial features of Karlstadt.
- <sup>13</sup> Ulrich Bubenheimer, Art. Karlstadt, Andreas Rudolff Bodenstein von (1486-1541), in: TRE, vol.17, Berlin et al. 1988, pp. 649 - 657, here p. 655. On the occasion of the passing of Simon Grynaeus (1st August 1541), a colleague of Karlstadt at the University of Basel, a 29-page "In Simonem Gryneum ... Epicedion" (VD 16 P 1119) was published in accordance with the prevalent custom by Johannes Pedionius in the Basel printing office of Robert Winters, yet with no portrait.
- <sup>14</sup> Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, Dasein und Vision. Bürger und Bauern um 1500. Ausstellung im Alten Museum vom 8. Dezember 1989 bis 12. Februar 1990, Berlin 1989, No. C 59, p. 130f. Bubenheimer's explanatory notes on this figure state: "The memorial print for the late Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt (born 1486, passed away on 24 December 1541) was published by an unknown printer in Basel. It offers the only authentic portrait of Karlstadt, who was a professor of theology in Basel from 1534 to 1541, and is here presented in academic garb by an unknown artist."
- <sup>15</sup> On Adam von Bodenstein (1528 – 1577) see: Wilhelm Kühlmann / Joachim Telle (eds.), Corpus Paracelsisticum. Dokumente frühneuzeitlicher Naturphilosophie in Deutschland, vol. 1, p. 104ff.
- <sup>16</sup> "Every time I see this leaflet, simultaneously I feel happy and mourn, because the blessed dead person is present." State and University Library of Bern: Hospinian 7 (cf. Margaret Eschler, Sammlung Hospinian, eine Gelehrtenbibliothek aus dem 16. Jahrhundert, Bern 1998, No. 62, p. 10). The commemorative leaflet is reproduced in: Ulrich Bubenheimer / Stefan Oehmig (eds.), Querdenker der Reformation - Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt und seine frühe Wirkung, Würzburg 2001, p. 19.

cheekbones form a distinctive middle part of the face. His eyes, looking straight ahead and lying rather deep under his eyebrows, render Karlstadt's facial expression calm. The artist did not endeavor to make a schematic portrait, rather he lent his efforts towards portraying an individual in his mid-fifties.

## II. A Double Portrait by Lucas Cranach – Andreas Karlstadt and Anna von Mochau

In the context of a Cranach Exhibition at the Frankfurt Städel Museum (2007/2008)<sup>17</sup>, the consideration first emerged of whether a 1522<sup>18</sup> portrait by Cranach the Elder of a clean-shaven man (Fig. 4) and its counterpart, the portrait of a young woman (Fig. 5), could possibly portray Andreas Karlstadt and Anna of Mochau, whose wedding had taken place on January 19<sup>th</sup> of that year.<sup>19</sup>

This double portrait, known to the art-interested public since the 1920s, is considered one of the finest works by Lucas Cranach the Elder. The paintings have been located in the National Gallery of Art in Washington since 1959.<sup>20</sup> Although they are mentioned and discussed in several catalogues<sup>21</sup>, research to date has not yet identified the persons shown.

The 58 x 39.8 cm painting (Fig. 4) displays the portrait of an unknown clean-shaven man in front of a monochromatic green background<sup>22</sup>, only partially darkened by the shadow of the depicted person.

<sup>17</sup> Bodo Brinkmann (ed.), *Cranach der Ältere: anlässlich der Ausstellung Cranach der Ältere, Städel-Museum Frankfurt am Main, 23. November 2007 bis 17. Februar 2008, Royal Academy of Arts, London, 8. März bis 8. Juni 2008. Ostfildern 2007.*

<sup>18</sup> There is a cartellino in the upper left-hand corner with the year "1522", and below it the Cranach-signet with the winged snake (see the magnified reproduction of this detail in J. O. Hand / S. E. Mansfield, *German Paintings of the Fifteenth through seventeenth Centuries, (The Collections of the National Gallery of Art. Systematic Catalogue) Baltimore - Hong Kong 1993; Accession No. 1959.9.1 (Portrait of a Man), Accession No. 1959.9.2. (Portrait of a Woman), pp. 40 - 44.*

<sup>19</sup> I am in debt to the city archivist of Orlamünde, Dr. Peter Lange, for this suggestion. In a conversation on 21 December 2012 he informed me about his visit to the Cranach the Elder exhibition in Frankfurt (2007) and his reflections on this topic. Since Dr. Lange was not able to pursue this question further, he generously shared his idea with me and offered his collegial cooperation.

<sup>20</sup> Description and provenience in: John Oliver Hand / Sally E. Mansfield, *German Paintings* (as in note 18), pp. 40-44. See the high-definition color digital images in the internet portal of the National Gallery of Art in Washington, D.C.: *Portrait of a Man* (<https://www.nga.gov/Collection/art-object-page.45886.html>) and *Portrait of a Woman* (<https://www.nga.gov/Collection/art-object-page.45887.html>).

<sup>21</sup> Max J. Friedländer / Jakob Rosenberg [henceforth: FR], *Die Gemälde von Lucas Cranach*, Berlin 1932 (2. Edition Basel, Boston and Stuttgart 1979), No.145 and 146 (Portraits of a Clean-shaven Young Man and a Young Lady); Brinkmann (as in note 17), No. 70 (Bildnis eines bartlosen Mannes), No. 71 (Bildnis einer jungen Frau); Claus Grimm / Johannes Erichsen / Evamaria Brockhoff, *Lucas Cranach. Ein Maler-Unternehmer aus Franken, Augsburg 1994, No.157/158, (Bildnis eines Mannes/ einer Frau) pp. 335-338; Tanja Holste, Die Porträtkunst Lucas Cranachs d.Ä., (Dissertation) Kiel 2004, pp. 197-200.*

<sup>22</sup> See Hand/ Mansfield, *NGA-Catalogue* (1993) [as in note 18]: "Examination with infrared reflectography did not disclose underdrawing. The background is built up in layers and consequently is thicker than other areas of the painting. It appears that a brown layer was applied over the ground throughout, visible in the upper left under the artist's serpent device. The background consists of additional green-yellow and green-blue layers as well as a glaze layer to create areas of shadows." (p. 40). In an E-mail from the NGA-curator John Oliver Hand to the author (29th September 2015) he states: "To the best of my knowledge the green backgrounds of both portraits are original and do not cover up anything such as an inscription."

A brown coat over the shoulders and upper body and a wide black cap<sup>23</sup> covering the head intensifies the effect of his highly vivid and nuanced face in three-quarter profile turned to the right. The dark brown hair falling down both sides of the face emphasizes the contours of his cheekbones. Between light brown eyes a wide nasal bridge merges into a slightly curved, prominent nasal ridge. The slightly protruding tip of the nose and clearly-shaped nostrils intensify the dominance of the nose in the middle part of the face. The mouth, with a thin upper lip and a slightly protruding lower lip, rests over a slender chin. The hint of a developing double chin appears above the visible Adam's apple. Altogether his face leans towards a darker complexion, especially when contrasted to the white collar and the light skin color of his wife.

A direct comparison of the physiognomic traits of both images (the Basel woodcut [1541/42]: Fig. 3; and the Cranach painting 1522: Fig. 4), is complicated by the different mediums of woodcut and painting<sup>24</sup> as well as the size differences of the two portraits. Further complicating matters, the age difference between the depicted persons and the partially concealed parts of the face (from the beard covered upperlip and jaw-line in the woodcut to the cap covered hairline in the painting) have to be taken into account. The comparison is enhanced, however, because in each case the figure is presented in a three-quarter profile facing right, albeit with a slightly differing angle.

Despite these hidden sections, taking the middle section of the face of both portraits into focus reveals the strong conformity of the distinctive profile of the nose and the right profile line of eye and cheek. Both images combine this characteristic feature with calm eyes. These similarities make the identification of the *same* person shown in different stages of life plausible.<sup>25</sup> It is indeed possible that Cranach the Elder's 1522 unknown clean-shaven man could be Andreas Bodenstein von Karlstadt, at that time 36 years old, making the counterpart painting attributable to his young wife Anna of Mochau.

In research to date, the identification of images is established through the interplay between subjective observations and historical indications.<sup>26</sup> Thus, in addition to the affirmation of the

---

<sup>23</sup> This type of cap is shown on different sketches and portraits: e.g. the imperial herald Jakob Sturm (by Albrecht Dürer 1520; Friedrich Winkler, *Die Zeichnungen Albrecht Dürers*, vol. 4, Berlin 1939, No. 765); a goldsmith from Mecheln (by Albrecht Dürer 1520; Winkler, No. 745); Fredric III. prince elector of Saxony (by Albrecht Dürer; *Köpfe der Lutherzeit –as note 6; No. 63*), the patrician Joachim Rehle (by Hans Maler, 1524; Dresden, *Gemäldegalerie Alte Meister*, Gal.-No. 1902) and count Philipp von Solms (by Lucas Cranach the Elder, 1524; FR, No. 114).

<sup>24</sup> The comparability of painted portraits with printed portraits (based on woodcuts) can be judged by juxtaposing portraits of Martin Luther as "Junker Jörg", for example; as a woodcut by Lucas Cranach the Elder from 1522 (e.g. in M. Geisberg / W. Strauss *The German Single-Leaf Woodcut: 1500-1550*, New York 1974, vol. 2, No. 605), as a painting by Lucas Cranach the Elder [1521/22] (Leipzig, *Museum der Bildenden Künste*, Inv. No. 566: e.g. fig. in Brinkmann (as in note 17) No. 39, p. 191).

<sup>25</sup> A comparison between the woodcut portrait (fig. 2 and 3) and the Basel copperplate portrait (fig. 1), both of which are of a small size, presents hardly any physiognomic reference points which speak to a probable identity of the persons shown. Bubenheimer (as in note 14) made the following observation already in 1989: "The authenticity of a Karlstadt portrait that has been reproduced often (copper engraving in the portrait collection of the Basel University Library ...) must now be considered as uncertain, especially since the name of Karlstadt was added to the Basel copper engraving in a handwritten note pasted under the picture (in the seventeenth century?)"

<sup>26</sup> See Hjalmar Sander, *Zur Identifizierung zweier Bildnisse von Lucas Cranach D.Ä. [1529: Johannes Scheuring, and 1509: Georg Spalatin]* in: *Zeitschrift für Kunstwissenschaft* vol. IV, No. 1/2 (1950), pp. 35-48. Expectations of providing more objective evidence by means of computerized image analysis have not been fulfilled, since differences in the size of the two portraits, variations in the tilt of the head and the turn of the faces made this impossible.

probable identity of the clean-shaven man in Cranach's painting (1522) with Karlstadt through subjective/ visual observations, the plausibility of this presumption also needs to be consistent with the historical context in 1521/22.

In the summer of 1521 Karlstadt critically examined the church's position of mandatory celibacy in a series of theses and discussed the matter critically in both Latin and vernacular pamphlets.<sup>27</sup> First clerical marriages occurred in May 1521, including the public marriage of Bartholomäus Bernhardi from Feldkirch. The marriage of this theologian, a provost in nearby Kemberg since 1519 and educated in Wittenberg from 1512 to 1518, where he was also a member of the inner circle of the Wittenberg Reformers, caused a great sensation.<sup>28</sup> A widely distributed, anonymous defense of Bernhardi was attributed to Karlstadt's authorship.<sup>29</sup>

As the first of the Wittenberg Reformers to take this step, Karlstadt celebrated his betrothal to Anna von Mochau on 26 December 1521, and they were married on 19 January 1522. Through his own marriage, he wanted to set a public and constructive example; by his "example and paradigm", he hoped to encourage many priests, who were living in the morally-reprehensible consequences of celibacy ("in the devil's prison and jail"), to marry.<sup>30</sup> Present at his betrothal in nearby Seegrehna (the home of the bride) were two wagons filled with Wittenberg colleagues and friends, among them Philip Melanchthon<sup>31</sup> and Justus Jonas<sup>32</sup> (who married shortly thereafter on February 9). For the wedding and the elaborately prepared feast, Karlstadt publically invited the teaching staff of the university and the Wittenberg town council.<sup>33</sup> He also invited his sovereign, the Elector Prince Frederic III., with a personally addressed letter "to gracefully be present in person".<sup>34</sup> In light of the

<sup>27</sup> "I would like for the Pope to show me a spiritual estate of believers that has shunned the marital bed. Priests and all ministers have had wives before, in, and after the law. Aaron, the Levites, the prophets and the apostles of Christ were married. Only the regiment of the Antichrist is in the unmarried and demonic estate ..."; *Von Gelübden Unterrichtung*, fol. H4<sup>v</sup> (A. Zorzin, *Karlstadt als Flugschriftenautor*, Göttingen 1990, No. 39, p.[287]) For the general background see Stephen E. Buckwalter, *Die Priesterehe in Flugschriften der frühen Reformation*, Gütersloh 1998.

<sup>28</sup> On Bernhardi (1487-1551) see Helmar Junghans, in: Hans J. Hillerbrand (ed.), *The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Reformation*, Vol. 1, Oxford / New York 1996, pp. 145-146.

<sup>29</sup> On this, see Ulrich Bubenheimer, "Der Fall Bartholomäus Bernhardi", in: idem, *Streit um das Bischofsamt in der Wittenberger Reformation 1521/1522. Von der Auseinandersetzung mit den Bischöfen um Priesterehen und den Ablaß in Halle zum Modell des evangelischen Gemeindebischofs*, ZSavRG vol. 104. (Kan. Abt. vol. 73) 1987, pp.170-190; on the wider impact of the *Apologia pro .M. Bartolomeo Praeposito qui uxorem in sacerdotio duxit*, 1521 (German version: *Das die Priester Ee weyber nemen mögen und sollen*, 1522) see especially pp. 184-190.

<sup>30</sup> Public invitation of 5 January 1521 (Nikolaus Müller, *Die Wittenberger Bewegung 1521-1522. Die Vorgänge in und um Wittenberg während Luthers Wartburgaufenthalt. Briefe, Akten und dergleichen und Personalien*, Leipzig (second edition) 1911, No. 65, p. 145f.); also disseminated in printed form under the title *Sendbrief D. Andreas B. von Karlstadt meldend seine Wirtschaft* (Zorzin, as in note 27; No. 47, p.[290]).

<sup>31</sup> On Melanchthon (1497- 1560), cf. Bietenholz, vol. 2 (as in note 2) pp. 424-429.

<sup>32</sup> On Jonas (1493- 1555), cf. Bietenholz, vol. 2 (as note 2) pp. 244-246.

<sup>33</sup> "Item. on Saint Stephen's day [26. December] Doctor Carlstadt betrothed himself in marriage to a young maiden, the daughter of a poor nobleman, in the presence of two wagons full of erudite and valiant people, such as the provost [= Justus Jonas] and Philip Melanchton. Carlstadt also gave his cook to the parish priest in marriage, they married soon after. His [= Carlstadts] wedding is about to take place; he wants to go to great expenses, invite the whole university, the whole city council, says himself that he sent more than 50 gilders to Leipzig for spices and other things, and wants to invite bishops and princes;...", Müller (as in note 30) No. 68, pp.155 - 159 (my translation).

<sup>34</sup> Karlstadts letter to the prince elector (6 January 1522), Müller (see note 30) No. 66, p. 146f.

intentional staging of this wedding, the possibility that an order of an appropriate portrait of the couple was made to his friend Cranach seems very likely.<sup>35</sup>

Details concerning Karlstadt's wife are found in Wittenberg letters and reports in temporal proximity to the engagement and marriage. He himself reports in his invitation addressed to the Elector about his "engagement with the honorable virgin Anna Mochaw."<sup>36</sup> His colleague Justus Jonas mentioned Karlstadt's wife in letters to Wolfgang F. Capito<sup>37</sup> and Johann Lang<sup>38</sup> as "puella nobilis, sed pauper".<sup>39</sup> A report states: "On St. Stevens Day [December 26th] a honorable virgin, not so pretty and poor, from the lineage von Mochaw, niece to Christoff von Mochaw, residing one mile from Wittenberg in Segraen, was given as a bride to Karlstadt."<sup>40</sup> According to this information, the young noble Anna von Mochau was living in modest circumstances and was related to Christoph von Mochau, the master of Seegrehna as a liege of the Ernestine royal line.<sup>41</sup> Albert Burer, a letter writer who studied in Wittenberg at that time, estimated Anna's age to be 15 years based on her facial expression.<sup>42</sup>

Taking into account the probable identification of the "young clean-shaven man" of the 1522 Cranach double-portrait with Andreas Bodenstein of Karlstadt, the corresponding "young woman" would be identified as Anna von Mochau. Only the subjective appeal for a higher age for the woman in Cranach's portrait of the young lady than the estimation of Albert Burer could speak against this impression. In comparison with Cranach paintings of women of different ages it is clear that, in most cases, the subjective age assessment by an observer today results in older estimations than the actual age.<sup>43</sup>

The reality that Karlstadt introduced innovations into the religious service in Wittenberg at the end of 1521 (e.g. lay chalice) and that this happened hand-in-hand with a "clothing-style staging" should be taken into consideration here.<sup>44</sup> Karlstadt's intention was to achieve a "de-clericalization" of his

<sup>35</sup> A comparison with portraits of Bartholomäus Bernhardi (see O. Thulin, *Cranachaltäre der Reformationszeit*, Berlin 1955, Dessauer Altar: fig. 130, p. 110 and Kemberger Altar: fig. 141, p. 116) and of Justus Jonas (see A. Zorzín, *Eine unbeachtete Identifizierung: Das Cranach-Porträt des Justus Jonas*, *Nordhäuser Nachrichten* Jg. 24:4 (2015) 10-11) resulted in no physiognomic similarities with the Cranach painting of the clean shaven man (1522).

<sup>36</sup> Karlstadt's letter to the prince elector (6 January 1522), Müller (see note 30) Nr.66, p.146-7.

<sup>37</sup> On Capito (ca. 1478 - 1541), cf. Bietenholz, vol. 1 (as in note 2) pp. 261-264.

<sup>38</sup> On Lang (ca. 1486 – 1548), cf. Bietenholz, vol. 2 (as in note 2) p. 289.

<sup>39</sup> Müller (as in note. 300) No. 69 (8 January 1522), p. 165.

<sup>40</sup> Müller (as in note 300) No. 73 (between 1 and 19 January 1522) p. 170.

<sup>41</sup> See the information on him provided by Müller (as note. 30) in note 2, p. 132f. In a letter to the Basel council written (30 May 1542) after the death of Karlstadt, Christoph von Mochau refers to Karlstadt's widow Anna as "the daughter of my brother"; thus Spalatin's information that she was "Heinrici Mochi filiam" appears to be correct and Christoph was the guardian of the orphaned children of his brother; see Barge (as note 4) vol. 2, p. 516.

<sup>42</sup> "...anno nata[m] (quantum ex facie conicere licuit) quindecim"; Müller (as in note. 30) No. 102 (27 March 1522), p. 212.

<sup>43</sup> Cranach the Elder portrayed Sibylle of Cleve as a bride (1526) and later as the electoral princess of Saxony (1531). On the first portrait (FR 305; fig. in Grimm –as note 21– No. A76, p. 135) she appears girl-like (having been born in 1512, she was 14 years old); on the second portrait (FR 348; fig. idem., No. A77, p. 135,) she gives the impression of being an adult woman in spite of her 19 years of age. The same observation can be made in the case of Holbein (portrait of a lady of the Cromwell family, whose age is indicated on the painting as being 21; in O. Bätschmann / P. Grienien, *Hans Holbein*, Köln 1977, No. 230, p. 171).

<sup>44</sup> "Doctor Karlstat held a mass they call evangelical in the parish church in Wittenberg, in worldly garments, without any clerical robes or ceremonies. He gave communion in both kinds to up to two thousand people ...

person. Alongside his decision to marry, he symbolically demonstrated his refusal to differentiate between clerics and laypeople or burghers (due to celibacy) by growing out his tonsure and wearing secular garments.

Missing biographical clues for the couple depicted in Cranach's double portrait (1522) led to attempts to determine their societal position from their garments. Art historians have predominately associated the couple with the bourgeois class<sup>45</sup> or the lower nobility, and at the very least members of the common aristocracy.<sup>46</sup> As archdeacon of the Wittenberg All Saints' Foundation, a doctor in both canon and civil law, and longtime professor of the Wittenberg Faculty of Theology, Karlstadt and Anna von Mochau, herself descended from landed gentry, fit one another's social status and belonged at least to the upper urban bourgeoisie of that time.<sup>47</sup> Since the image of the husband allows the discrete glance of the collar of a shirt adorned with a knot pattern and a black jerkin with white slit sleeves, this could indicate a corresponding class consciousness equaling his noble wife,<sup>48</sup> who has a golden brooch on her bonnet.

---

He allowed his tonsure to grow over and claims that if the enterprise of the evangelical mass does not succeed, he will never hold any other mass and will buy himself a house in Wittenberg and earn a living with brewing and selling [beer] like any other peasant. " (source as in note 30 – my transl.)

<sup>45</sup> Hand / Mansfield, NGA-Catalogue (1993) [as in note 18]: "...this ... couple is dressed in clothing of understated elegance and severity. (...) The costumes suggest that the man and woman are either patricians or members of the wealthy middle class. (p. 41)"; Tanja Holste (as in note 21) "the [... modesty of the ... (p. 200)] garments of the married couple provides no information as to whether they belong to the wealthy gentry or patriciate. (p.199)"; Brinkmann (as in note 17) "... the pair of portraits (offers) the perfect mise-en-scène of patrician elegance and refinement." (p. 261, my translations).

<sup>46</sup> Claus Grimm (as in note 21) "... the embroidery on the shirt of the husband and on the waistbelt of the wife and the ... brooch on the hat of the wife are indicative of a refined outfit, typical for noble people or members of the city patriciate" (p. 336, my transl.). Holste (as in note 21) calls attention to the fact, that "the rich outfit off the Buchner couple" [Cranach the Elder, double portrait 1518 of Moritz und Anna Buchner (nee Lindacker), Minneapolis Institute of Arts] shows, how "the rising middle classes could display such accessories [like the brooch on the hat covering of the young unknown woman]" (p. 199, note 607; my translations).

<sup>47</sup> See Bernd Moeller, *Die Brautwerbung Martin Bucers für Wolfgang Capito. Zur Sozialgeschichte des evangelischen Pfarrerstandes*, in: Johannes Schilling (ed.), *Bernd Moeller: Die Reformation und das Mittelalter. Kirchenhistorische Aufsätze*, Göttingen 1991, pp. 151 - 160: "several of the leading Reformers married noblewomen. This holds true not only for Luther, but also, for instance, for Karlstadt, ... for Eberlin, ... in fact, even for Thomas Müntzer ... This constellation of remarkably analogous marriages in the initial years of the Reformation was probably more than just a coincidence ... It is rather a reflection of the prestige of the protagonists. It was also probably influenced by the medieval notion that the conferall of the doctoral title entailed social ascent" (p. 160). The "Bodenstein coat of arms" is depicted in the upper left-hand corner of the Karlstadt-Cranach *wagon* woodcut; on this, see Bubenheimer's article in the *Festschrift* of the city of Karlstadt (as in note 6), p. 6.: "The helmet and helmet crest are indicative of the coat of arms of a nobleman (*Junkerswappen*), which could be a reference to a possible noble background of the Bodenstein family. Further evidence for this is provided by the fact that Andreas Bodenstein's son Adam (1528 - 1577) calls himself Adam *von* Bodenstein in his writings."

<sup>48</sup> The fact that Karlstadt made no secret of his inclination for stylish clothes at least after his study stay in Rome (1516) was something Luther clearly remembered (see WA TR 6, No. 6874: "Karlstadt was very presumptuous because he had succeeded in being able to hold a disputation in the most important collegium, the domus sapientiae, and came back to Germany very arrogant and well-dressed.").

### III. Cranach and Karlstadt

The first testimony to the long-standing relationship between Cranach the Elder and Karlstadt is an epigram<sup>49</sup> published by the latter in 1509 for his fellow Franconian compatriots and "amicos amicissimos" Christoph Scheurl<sup>50</sup> and Lucas Cranach the Elder. This humanistic style poem, complete with a wealth of classical allusions, indicates the familiar acquaintance between the then 23-year old Wittenberg lecturer and his 14 year-senior artist friend, "his Lucas."<sup>51</sup> Karlstadt, proving that he has a sense for fine-art techniques, emphasized the spatial perspective and the illusive luminance of Cranach's paintings in his poem.<sup>52</sup> He also sensitively protects both his friends against grudges and critics. Karlstadt's poem warmly concludes with the old hebraic wisdom: "Nothing better for the body than keeping silent".

One proof of direct and creative collaboration between Cranach and Karlstadt is the "first printed illustrated broadsheet of the reformation movement,"<sup>53</sup> which was designed at the end of 1518 and published early in 1519 illustrated with an ornate Cranach woodcut. The broadsheet shows two wagons, one on top of the other, moving in opposite directions, the upper wagon in the direction of Christ, and the lower into the mouth of hell.<sup>54</sup> At the beginning of 1519<sup>55</sup> Cranach was elected into one of three regularly rotating councils which formed the Wittenberg town council.<sup>56</sup> Ulrich Bubenheimer's assessment that Cranach and the goldsmith Christian Döring, a fellow member of the same council, were "exponents of a party who supported the interests of the territorial ruler in the Wittenberg town council" is confirmed by the sources.<sup>57</sup>

In January 1522, negotiations took place between a university commission consisting of Justus Jonas, Andreas Karlstadt, Philipp Melanchthon, Nikolaus von Amsdorf<sup>58</sup> and the rector Johann Eisermann, along with the town council, with the aim to develop a new and reform-oriented religious service and

<sup>49</sup> Ad prudentissimum D'ominum! Christoferum Scheur- || lum Noricum ut[r]iusque Iuris Doctorem ac civi- || lis interpretem. Et ad Lucam Chronucium || Pictorie artis summo successu Magistrum ami- || cos amicissimos carmen Andree Bodensteini. in: Oratio doctoris Scheurlii attingens litterarum prestantiam, necnon lauden Ecclesie Collegiate Vittenburgensis, Leipzig: Martin Landsberg, 1509, [fol. C5<sup>v</sup>], VD16 S 2803 (digitalized); cf. Th. Kaufmann et al.: Kritische Gesamtausgabe Karlstadt (2017), vol. I,1 No. 5 (further on KGK)

<sup>50</sup> Cranach the Elder had portrayed the Wittenberg professor, doctor of both laws, and Franconian compatriot and friend who heaped much praise on him, Christoph Scheurl, in 1509 in a way befitting to his social status; fig. e.g. in Grimm (as in note 21), p. 335, no. 156; see also Holste (as in note 220), pp. 210 - 214.

<sup>51</sup> "Cui tribuunt quodcunque bonis pictoribus ipse | Plinius; est Luce gloria tanta meo." (line 5 - 6) (he [= Lukas] is ascribed virtues that even Pliny always ascribes to good painters. So much fame is bestowed upon my Lukas). Cf. KGK I,1 no. 5 (as in note 49).

<sup>52</sup> "Perspectiva caput effinxitque fovetque | nobilis ars qua sic pingere rite valet." (line 7 - 8) (This head [= Cranach] fashioned and fosters perspectives, a noble art by means of which he is capable of painting so properly.); "Luce Chronachii captio luce vigenis" (line 14) (Lucas Cranach's deception with light is highly reputed). Cf. KGK I,1 Nr. 5 (as in note 49)

<sup>53</sup> Ulrich Bubenheimer (as in note 13) p. 650.

<sup>54</sup> Geisberg / Strauss (as in note 24) No. 612; Zorzin (as in note 27) No.10f., p. [279].

<sup>55</sup> Werner Schade, Die Malerfamilie Cranach, Dresden 1974, p. 409, No. 157.

<sup>56</sup> See Ulrich Bubenheimer, Luthers Stellung zum Aufruhr in Wittenberg 1520-1522 und die frühreformatorischen Wurzeln des landesherrlichen Kirchenregiments, ZRG 102 Kan.Abt. 71 (1985) p. 175f.

<sup>57</sup> Ibid.; see Cranach's letter (13 January 1521) informing the Electoral Saxon court that a new mayor has been elected; in: Dieter Koepplin / Tilman Falk, Lukas Cranach. Gemälde, Zeichnungen, Druckgraphik. Ausstellung im Kunstmuseum Basel 15. Juni bis 8. September 1974, 2 vols., Basel and Stuttgart 1974 and 1976; vol.2, No. 659b, p. 732.

<sup>58</sup> On Amsdorf (1483-1565) see Bietenholz vol. 1 (as in note 2), pp. 51-52)

community order for Wittenberg. The proceedings were concluded on January 24th with the agreement of the entire town council.<sup>59</sup> The community order regulated the modified procedure of the religious service, aid for the urban poor, and the removal of religious images from the parish church.<sup>60</sup> However, the implementation was forbidden by the territorial ruler, Elector Prince Frederic III. As Cranach and Döring were part of the town council governing for one year after February 9, 1522,<sup>61</sup> which was led by the "court-loyal" mayor Dr. Christian Beyer, it would be reasonable to suppose that they were not supporters of the order and proceedings concluded earlier.<sup>62</sup> However, at least during the turn of the year from 1521 to 1522, and especially with this being the height of Karlstadt's popularity as a reformer and publisher, the sources do not, in my opinion, support the idea that "Cranach, as council man, wealthy and court painter[...], was surely on the side of those who wanted to get rid of Karlstadt".<sup>63</sup>

A possible sign of aggravation in their relationship can be found in a text on Cranach's single-leaf woodcut of Luther as "Junker Jörg".<sup>64</sup> A statement written on one of the text variants of this 1522 publication, indicates that Luther returned to the Saxon fields because of the rage of Karlstadt, in order to tear the sheep from furious jaws.<sup>65</sup> Such a retrospective view, which did not necessarily come from Cranach himself, presupposes the impact of Luther's preaching after his return on March 6, 1522. Thus, such a description of the situation can hardly be expected before April or May of that same year. Therefore, the commission for a painting by Cranach, on behalf of his well-known compatriot Karlstadt, on the occasion of his engagement and marriage to Anna von Mochau, fits into the context of the turn of the year 1521/1522.

The 1522 painting by Cranach the Elder is with high probability an accurate portrayal of Andreas Bodenstein of Karlstadt. This painting, along with a re-evaluation of the history of research on

<sup>59</sup> See Bubenheimer (as in note 56) p.176.

<sup>60</sup> See Hans-Ulrich Delius (ed.), Martin Luther. Studienausgabe, vol. 2, Berlin 1992, p. 527, line 20f.: "13. Item, The images and altars in the churches should also be abolished, so that idolatry be avoided, for three altars without images suffice" (my translation).

<sup>61</sup> Müller (as in note 30) p.172/ note 4.

<sup>62</sup> In 1974, Johannes Wallmann called attention to the fact that Karlstadt sought to make a connection in *Von Abtuhung der Bilder* between his complaint that the council was not quick enough in implementing the agreed-upon provisions and the new ruling council body of Wittenberg: ".. the new burgomaster (the former electoral councilor Christian Beyer) the painter Lukas Cranach and the goldsmith Christian Düring, ..., as friends of images they endeavored to oppose the implementation of the prohibition of images..." in: Heiko A. Oberman (ed.) Luther and the Dawn of the Modern Era. Papers for the 4th international Congress for Luther Research, Leiden 1974, p. 218.

<sup>63</sup> Koeplin / Falk (as in note 57) vol.1, no. 42, p. 98.

<sup>64</sup> This single sheet woodcut print (Geisberg / Strauss, –as in note 24–, vol. 2, No. 605) is extant in three different textual variants. All three place the following text in four lines at the center under the picture: "Quaesitus toties, toties tibi Roma petitus / En ego per Christum vivo Lutherus adhuc / Una mihi spes est, quo non fraudabor, Iesus / Hunc mihi dum teneam, perfida Roma vale." One variant presents the title "Lutherus" above the picture (Ex.: Wien, Graphische Sammlung Albertina), the other two variants have the text: "Imago Martini Lutheri, eo habitu expressa, quo reversus est ex Pathmo Wittenbergam, Anno domini 1522" (Ex. Bamberg, Staatsbibliothek und Kunstsammlung Veste Coburg). One variant of the latter presents an additional chronogram in three parts listing the events of the years 1521-1522 below the text shared by all three variants: "Annus confessionis. Wormaciae. 1521", "Annus Pathmi. 1521", "Annus reditus ex Pathmo. 1522"; reproduced in Wartburg-Jahrbuch/ Sonderband 1996, Eisenach 1996, p. 27.

<sup>65</sup> "Annus reditus ex Pathmo. 1522. / Carlstadii ob furias ad Saxona tecta recurrit, / Faucibus ex saevis rursus ovesque rapit."

Karlstadt images, unmask the widespread image of the "sinister iconoclast" as a mere historical construct.

If this unidentified portrait indeed depicts Karlstadt, it contains multiple significances for the history of Reformation: It would be the first painting of a Reformer with a certain dating, the first painting of a married reformed cleric and an indication that Karlstadt's critique of religious images in January 1522 was not an attack against the secular painting outside of the church.

This presumed double portrait of Karlstadt and his wife may have survived the centuries because it was a work of extraordinary quality by Cranach the Elder and since it lacked any indication of the identification of the sitters, it was saved from any positional motivated destruction.

Dr. Alejandro Zorzin  
Karlstadt-Edition  
Akademie der Wissenschaften  
Göttingen/ Germany  
[alejandro.zorzin@mail.uni-goettingen.de](mailto:alejandro.zorzin@mail.uni-goettingen.de)

2017-11-01  
Karlstadt-Edition